



# Quality Assurance Program for the TVA Kingston Ash Recovery Project

EMDQ Workshop

Arlington, Virginia | March/April 2011

Presented by:

Stephen D. Brower, P.G., Geosciences Department Manager /  
Associate Principal - Environmental Standards, Inc.

Co-authors:

William J. Rogers, Neil E. Carriker – Tennessee Valley Authority  
Rock Vitale, Ruth Forman, Dennis Callaghan –  
Environmental Standards, Inc.

Acknowledgments to Kim Abbott - Environmental Standards, Inc. and  
Robert Crawford - Tennessee Valley Authority



Report Documentation Page				Form Approved OMB No. 0704-0188	
Public reporting burden for the collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instructions, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing the collection of information. Send comments regarding this burden estimate or any other aspect of this collection of information, including suggestions for reducing this burden, to Washington Headquarters Services, Directorate for Information Operations and Reports, 1215 Jefferson Davis Highway, Suite 1204, Arlington VA 22202-4302. Respondents should be aware that notwithstanding any other provision of law, no person shall be subject to a penalty for failing to comply with a collection of information if it does not display a currently valid OMB control number.					
1. REPORT DATE <b>31 MAR 2011</b>		2. REPORT TYPE		3. DATES COVERED <b>00-00-2011 to 00-00-2011</b>	
4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE <b>Quality Assurance Program for the TVA Kingston Ash Recovery Project</b>				5a. CONTRACT NUMBER	
				5b. GRANT NUMBER	
				5c. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER	
6. AUTHOR(S)				5d. PROJECT NUMBER	
				5e. TASK NUMBER	
				5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER	
7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) <b>Environmental Standards, Inc,1140 Valley Forge Road,P.O. Box 810,Valley Forge,PA,19482</b>				8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER	
9. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES)				10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S)	
				11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT NUMBER(S)	
12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT <b>Approved for public release; distribution unlimited</b>					
13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES <b>Presented at the 2011 DoD Environmental Monitoring &amp; Data Quality Workshop (EMDQ 2011), 28 Mar ? 1 Apr, Arlington, VA. U.S. Government or Federal Rights License</b>					
14. ABSTRACT					
15. SUBJECT TERMS					
16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF:			17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT <b>Same as Report (SAR)</b>	18. NUMBER OF PAGES <b>30</b>	19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON
a. REPORT <b>unclassified</b>	b. ABSTRACT <b>unclassified</b>	c. THIS PAGE <b>unclassified</b>			

# Agenda

- Client Background/  
Tennessee Valley  
Authority (TVA)
- Project Background/  
Event Facts
- Environmental  
Standards' Involvement
- Activities, Challenges, and  
Notes of Interest
- Project Accomplishments
- Conclusions





# TVA Kingston Fossil Plant

- Tennessee Valley Authority (TVA)  
Kingston Fossil Plant
  - 1.7-GW coal-burning power plant
  - Bordered by two rivers – Emory and Clinch
  - Uses on average 14,000 tons coal/day



June 2007

# Project Background/Event Facts

- December 22, 2008, shortly before 1 AM
- Ash dyke of 84-acre containment pond ruptured
  - 5.4 million cubic yards of fly ash into the Emory River
  - 1.1 Billion Gallons
  - Impacted over 300 acres



December 23, 2008



# Challenges?

- Many challenges in the initial response:
  - Organization
  - Resources
  - Planning
  - Health and Safety
  - Data Quality



# Incident Command

- TVA sample collection and environmental management in action within hours
- Sample collection begins with minimal documentation
- Regulatory agencies arrive
- Incident Command System (ICS) set up within days



A banner image showing a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky.

# Decision-Making

- Rapid decision-making but still, disorganization
- “Who is in charge” in spite of ICS and team efforts
- TVA environmental specialists rotate in on weekly basis but have substantial responsibilities elsewhere



# Field Sample Collection

- Understaffed TVA field sample collectors
  - Previous downsizing by TVA and elimination of Field Manual
  - No Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) applicable to specific project collection activities
  - No consistent nomenclature



A banner image showing a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky.

# Data Management

- TVA IT staff rotated members on-site to manage Scribe Access™ and implement data reasonableness rules
- It becomes obvious that assistance is needed and there were needs for longer term
  - Planning
  - Staffing
  - Niche consulting expertise

# Environmental Standards' Involvement

- Contracted January 21, 2009 - One month after event
- Provided
  - Observations and concerns
  - Global and specific recommendations
  - Initiated immediate actions to assist



# Immediate Observations

- Amazing effort from TVA personnel
  - Sustainable?
- Plans - Lack of overall QA plan and SOPs
- DM tools and process
  - Very manual
- TVA personnel
  - need to return to pre-December 22 roles and have project structure put into place



# Immediate Concerns

- Concern about integrity and quality of data
  - Initially lab data
- Need bulletproof, legally defensible data
  - Sampling issues
  - Laboratory issues
  - Data issues
- Crisis management
  - December 22, 2008 to March 2009



A banner image showing a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky. The title 'Global Recommendations' is overlaid in white text on a dark blue background.

# Global Recommendations

- Move away from Crisis to Project Management
  - Overall program/process
    - Sampling Point of Contact
    - Chemistry Point of Contact
    - Data Point of Contact
  - Step back and reassess
    - Roles and responsibilities
    - Business process/supporting functionality
    - Vendors/assist procurement



# Specific Recommendations

- Initial steps
  - Develop overall QA Plan document
    - Insert quality system, oversight for lab services, lab procurement
  - Transition from existing business process – day 1 forward
    - Real time data assessment of current data
  - Assume sampling oversight and training – develop SOPs
  - Implement data management process
- Assessment and loading of past data
  - Depends on lab production of data packages
  - Proofing output from database
  - Rigorous data validation

A banner image showing a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky.

# Immediate Actions: Data Management

- Implement a full cycle Data Management Process
- Implement an Enterprise Level Data Management System
  - Automating to maximum extent
    - Sample planning
    - Correctness / completeness checking
    - Automated data review - verification
    - Data validation support
    - Web Reporting (Self Service)
- Develop Data Management Plan

A banner image showing a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky.

# Immediate Actions: Quality Management

- Quality Assurance Plan - even though approval was months in coming
- Review/Add Laboratories
  - Time, quality, cost – pick two
  - Capable of electronic data deliverables



A banner image showing a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky.

# Immediate Actions: Laboratories

- Laboratory site visits
- EDD specifications in contract
- Data deliverables (Level I, Level IV)
- Helping client understand that the typical laboratory cannot provide 24-hour turn-around-time for extended periods

# Immediate Actions: Field Oversight

- Review Field Sampling Plans
- Sample crew training – consistency.
- Implement SOPs.
- Sub-contractor brought in excellent work ethic and quality process – no “recalibration”



A banner image showing a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky.

# Activities & Challenges

- Technical Tasks
  - Prepare Technical Requirements and RFP for the Procurement of Laboratories
  - Assess comparability of inter-laboratory data
  - Establish a Long Term Sample Retain Program
  - Establish a Rugged Laboratory PE Program
  - Support and Oversee Plaintiff/Third Party Sampling requests



A banner image showing a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky. The word "Activities" is written in white on a dark blue background.

# Activities

- TVA collected data for many reasons – Community Outreach, Worker Safety, Spill Investigation, Characterization, and Delineation, Regulatory Compliance, Waste Characterization, and many special studies
  - 310 Ash samples
  - 1686 Biota samples (Amphibians, Birds, Fish, Mammals, Vegetation, *etc.*)
  - 113 Ground Water samples
  - 4055 Particulate Matter samples
  - 354 Sediment samples
  - 87 Soil samples
  - 4053 Surface Water samples
- Over 600K analytical records, >1.2M related parameters, and >2M monitoring readings for Air and river water

A banner image showing a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky.

# Accomplishments

- Develop and support a business process that minimizes time from sample collection to release while ensuring that data were releasable.
- Establish a Quality Assurance Protocol and QAPP.
- Established a laboratory program.
- Prepared over 55 SOPs.
- Performed training and field oversights.



## Interesting things along the way...

- Dry-weight versus wet-weight versus as received reporting
- Laboratories don't always follow the published method or their own SOP
- Lead contamination – weights used for surface water sampling points were sources of contamination
- Defensible (truly) reporting down to a project method detection limit
- Legacy contamination of sediments prior to spill



## Interesting things along the way...

- Evaluation of custody seals.
- Using disposable in line 0.45 micron filters, although expensive, saves time, money and minimize the potential of contamination from excessive sample handling
- Blue ice does not cool samples. An ice bath is needed to cool samples.
- Proper fly ash homogenization requires tremendous effort.



# Interesting things along the way...

- Catching snapping turtles is tricky business



A banner image at the top of the slide shows a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky. The word "Conclusions" is written in white text on a dark blue background that is part of the banner.

# Conclusions

- Every Emergency Response starts off on the wrong foot...and behind in data reporting
- Emergency Response requires a different type of project planning and implementation – optimize for speed while appropriately adding control
- Labs and consultants that are nearest and dearest to the organization are not necessarily the best fit for the emergency.
- Understand that some data collected is not going to meet your needs.

A banner image showing a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky.

# Conclusions (Cont.)

- Plans, Processes, and Partners
  - Things to contemplate that should help
    - Have “on the shelf”
      - Quality Assurance Plan
      - Data Management Plan
      - Record Retention Plans
      - Framework for SOPs
- Making it up on the fly during the emergency response is too hard.

A banner image showing a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky.

## Conclusions (Cont.)

- If that doesn't work....more things to contemplate that should help
  - Difficult to staff an emergency response with internal personnel who already have jobs
    - Have Relationships/Partners “on the shelf” as well
      - Quality and Data Management
      - Field Sampling
      - Analytical Laboratories
      - Data Interpreters/Risk Assessors



A banner image showing a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky.

# Conclusions (Cont.)

- One cannot do enough to reduce confusion!
  - Until formal plans are in place, consider using an Analytical Request Form (ARF) in the early going!
    - Easy to implement
      - Collects information on
        - Reason for sample / data collection
        - What test / analytical sensitivities are desired
        - Who receives results or interprets the data

A banner image showing a sunset over a body of water with silhouettes of trees and birds in the sky.

## Conclusions (Cont.)

- Why am I harping on Quality Assurance and Data Management?
  - In the end all you have is data...

# Contact



**“Setting the Standards for Innovative Environmental Solutions”**

Stephen D. Brower  
Environmental Standards, Inc.  
1140 Valley Forge Road  
P.O. Box 810  
Valley Forge, PA 19482  
610.935.5577  
sbrower@envstd.com  
www.envstd.com